

WCF 's 24 Annual Issues are Cumulative

Each Stand Alone Issue is Piece of the Entire Channel.

WAREHOUSE CLUB FOCUS (WCF)

Annual Category Reviews

Product, Packaging, Merchandising Analysis

8 Issues per Year—WCF Original Content

Dry Grocery, Candy
Deli, Bakery, Meat
Freezer, Cooler
Organic

HBA, Softline, Office
Auto, Majors, Sundries
Spring, Summer Season
Fall, Winter Season

Reviewing Categories Outside Your Focus can Spark
Innovation Within

Annual Industry Updates

Macro Concepts

8 Issues per Year—WCF Original Content

Calendar Sales Review
Location Review
Expansion Projections
Industry Survey

Private Label Analysis
Fiscal Year Data
Web Site Update
Item Basket Analysis

Information in these Issues Provide a Broad Annual
Update of BJ's, Costco, PriceSmart and Sam's Club

Understanding Clubs & Buyers

Sales, Strategy Topics Reviewed Every 2-4 Years

1-3 Topics per Year—WCF Original Content

Business Item Analysis
International Divisions
Product Quality
Club Brokers

Club Buying Philosophies
Road Shows
Packaging
Member Profile

Knowledge from these Issues Help to Bolster Supplier
Sales and Marketing Strategies

Location Visits

What is Happening Inside BJ's, Costco and
Sam's Club Locations

2-6 Issues per Year—WCF Original Content

Industry News, Financials

Club Operator Press Releases and Regional, National
and International Media Reports

Every Issue—Summarized Reports

WCF is a Detailed Publication.

Although it Requires Some Time and Effort to Consume,
that Detail is in Part Due to Our Online Historical Data.

Warehouse Club Industry Guide

A 300+ Page Extensive Guide, Training Tool

Annually Updated—WCF Original Content

Industry Overview
Club Programs, Products
Understand Buyers
Detailed Operator Profile

Product Development
Marketing Money
Packaging
Operator History

Industry Snapshot

Industry Overview—90+ Slide Deck

Annually Updated—WCF Original Content

Industry History
Industry Overview
Club Products
Club Operations

Club Buying Strategies
Packaging
Merchandising
Operator Profile

Analytics

10 Downloadable Excel Files with Detailed History

Updated 6x Annually—WCF Original Content

Calendar Sales
Category Sales, SKUs
Fiscal Year Data
Private Label
Private Label Item List

Club Locations
Member Demographics
Item Basket Results
Category Analysis Data
Coupons

Image Hub

Searchable database of 15,600+ Product Pictures

Updated Frequently—WCF Original Content

Reconnaissance

42 Downloadable and Historical Category Excel Files
with Complete Product Assortments

Each Updated Annually—WCF Original Content

2024 Charter Subscription

Pay \$379—One Year

Save \$1,220

Pay \$579—Two Years

Save \$2,619

Your company will receive:

WCF Subscription - 24 issue annual subscription to *Warehouse Club Focus*.

Warehouse Club Industry Guide—Online access to the 2024 version.

Online Access - Full seven module online access.

Three Co-Workers - Add 3 co-workers onto the subscription for FREE.

WAREHOUSE CLUB FOCUS March 29, 2024
Volume 26, Issue 6/27
• 64-Page Color
• 8 1/2" x 11" (Landscape)
• 100% Recycled Paper

1 For 29 years, your best source for information about the clubs.

WCF Visits BJ's, Costco and Sam's Club in Connecticut and New York

WCF visits warehouse clubs around the world to search for information that provides subscribers with a unique insight into their buying and operating strategies. These visits enable us to keep readers informed about current merchandising techniques, product changes and packaging at the warehouse club level. Our reporters also provide manufacturers with ideas and strategies they can use to improve their business with the warehouse club regularly, nationally and internationally.

In March, 2024, WCF visited BJ's, Costco and Sam's Club locations in Connecticut and New York. See picture on the right from BJ's of a package of five 15-ounce bottles of *Not Mayo* plant based dressing and spread from *Ralica* for \$9.99.

These clubs included BJ's in White Plains, New York (a 155,000 square foot building opened in a former Sears in 2022) and Farmington, Connecticut (a 121,000 square foot location opened in 1991), Costco in Westchester, New York (a 140,000 total square foot industry building opened in 2022) and New Britain, Connecticut (a 154,000 square foot location opened in 2015) and a Sam's Club in Westport, New York (a 114,000 square foot building opened in 1984) and Newington, Connecticut (a 121,000 square foot location opened in 2009). The following are observations from these locations:

Pet - BJ's and Sam's Club stocked several unique pet products. BJ's stocked a 10-ounce bag of fish skin dog chews from *Dura Bark* for \$19.99, a 32-ounce bag of sweet potato chicken dog treats from *Delectables* for \$16.99, a 36-ounce bag of chicken jerky dog treat bundles from *Fall Moon* for \$19.99, a 30-ounce bag of *Chewies* dog treats from *Chewies* for \$19.99, a 20-ounce box of long lasting rope bone dog chews (11 each of chicken, vegetable and beef) from *Market Bites* for \$19.99, a 100-ounce bag of *Chewies* dog sticks from *Keweenaw* for \$14.99 (see picture on the left), a 10-ounce pack of chicken tender dog chews from *Delectables* for \$19.99, a 120-ounce case of 1 1/2-ounce packs of wet cat food in gravy (48 chicken and 24 each of salmon, tuna and turkey) from *Chick* for \$23.99, a 36-ounce bag of smoked chicken jerky dog treat bundles from *Waggin' Tails* for \$24.99, a 36-ounce bag of smoked chicken jerky dog treat bundles from *Waggin' Tails* for \$24.99 and a 17.5-ounce bag of high protein dog meal waffles with pork, bacon and banana from *Waggin' Tails* for \$20.99.

Meat - Costco and Sam's Club stocked several unique meat products. Costco stocked a 10-ounce bag of *Chewies* dog treats from *Chewies* for \$19.99, a 36-ounce bag of chicken jerky dog treat bundles from *Fall Moon* for \$19.99, a 30-ounce bag of *Chewies* dog treats from *Chewies* for \$19.99, a 20-ounce box of long lasting rope bone dog chews (11 each of chicken, vegetable and beef) from *Market Bites* for \$19.99, a 100-ounce bag of *Chewies* dog sticks from *Keweenaw* for \$14.99 (see picture on the left), a 10-ounce pack of chicken tender dog chews from *Delectables* for \$19.99, a 120-ounce case of 1 1/2-ounce packs of wet cat food in gravy (48 chicken and 24 each of salmon, tuna and turkey) from *Chick* for \$23.99, a 36-ounce bag of smoked chicken jerky dog treat bundles from *Waggin' Tails* for \$24.99, a 36-ounce bag of smoked chicken jerky dog treat bundles from *Waggin' Tails* for \$24.99 and a 17.5-ounce bag of high protein dog meal waffles with pork, bacon and banana from *Waggin' Tails* for \$20.99.

Electronics - BJ's electronics assortment included these introductory priced items from Warehouse: a 24-inch smart television with Roku for \$229.99, a 32-inch smart television with Roku for \$289.99 and a 43-inch smart television with Roku for \$429.99. BJ's electronics assortment also included two multi-ten items from *Thermax*, an Energizer lithium-ion wireless charging station for \$29.99 and an extendable wireless phone mount with a clip for \$24.99. The second pallet included two *Sirius* from *Smartop* an alarm clock and light with a phone charger for \$29.99 and a portable alarm clock with a phone charger for \$29.99.

Web Site If your company doesn't have web site access, take 7 minutes to watch an overview. Do You Have Access? Go to www.clubintelligencecenter.com

President and CEO History		
Mervyn Weich 1984 - 1986	Jim Singal 1984 - 2011	Ron Lovelace 1983 - 1988
John Levy 1987 - 1988	Craig Jelinek 2012 - 2023	Al Johnson 1989 - 1992
James Halpin 1989 - 1990	Ron Vachris 2024 -	Dean Sanders 1993 - 1995
Herbert Zarkin 1991 - 1992	PriceSmart	Joe Hardin Jr. 1995 - 1996
Allen Sherman 1993	Robert Price 2003 - 2009	Mark Hansen 1997 - 1998
Jack Nugent 1993 - 2001	Jose Luis Laparte 2010 - 2018	Thomas Grimm 1998 - 2002
Michael Wedge 2002 - 2005	Sherry Bahrambeygi 2018 - 2022	Kevin Turner 2002 - 2005
Herbert Zarkin 2006 - 2008	ROBTALLESB	Doug McMillon 2005 - 2009
Laura Sen 2009 - 2014	Jim Rose 1980 - 1998	Brian Cornell 2009 - 2011
Chris Baldwin 2015 - 2019	Jeffrey Meder 1999 - 2006	Rosalind Brewer 2012 - 2016
Lee Delaney 2020 - 2021	Rox Wilhelm 2007 - 2009	John Furrer 2017 - 2018
Bob Eddy 2021 -	Thomas Kallio 2009 - 2014	Kathryn McRay 2019 - 2023
	Kevin Proctor 2021 -	Chris Nicholas 2024 -

2024 Warehouse Club Industry Guide

Check Box

YES, I'd like to order WCF, the 2024 Guide, Online access and add 3 co-workers for \$379.

Check Box

YES, I'd like to order WCF, the 2024 Guide, Online access and add 3 co-workers for \$579.

PAYMENT

Name _____

Title/Position _____

Company _____

Mailing Address _____

Mailing City, State, Zip _____

Email _____

Phone _____

Invoice Me Check Enclosed AMEX MasterCard Visa

Credit Card, Expiration _____

CVV (AMEX—4 on front, Visa MasterCard—3 on back) _____

Billing Address _____

Billing City, State, Zip _____

Signature _____

To order: mail, fax or scan this form to:

HHC Publishing, Inc.
PO Box 9138
Foxboro, MA 02035-9138

Office: 617-770-0102
Fax: 617-479-4961

UNCONDITIONAL MONEY BACK GUARANTEE

If you are not completely satisfied with *Warehouse Club Focus*, the 2024 *Warehouse Club Industry Guide* or our seven module web site, HHC Publishing will refund your purchase in full.

Costco Buying and Operating

The foundation of Costco's buying and operating philosophy centers on ten key concepts: quality, low prices, six merchandising rights, consumer members, reduced operating expenses, fresh foods, creativity, supply chain, private label and organic. In addition, there are several principles that vendors need to understand to successfully sell a Costco buyer.

Quality

Quality is a part of Costco's culture and it permeates the company's actions and decisions. Costco believes it is wrong to offer low prices on low-quality merchandise. Costco's philosophy is to stock high-quality products at lower prices than can be found elsewhere. This creates the value proposition that convinces members to continue to pay to shop.

While there have been quotes from company executives over the years explaining that significance, the following passage from Howard Schultz's and Doris Jones Yang's book *"Pour Your Heart Into It: How Starbucks Built a Company One Cup at a Time,"* also, accurately describes how Costco's focus on quality has benefited the company over time.

"You don't just give the customers what they ask for. If you offer them something they're not accustomed to, something far superior that it takes a while to develop their palates, you can create a sense of discovery and excitement and loyalty that will bond them to you. It may take longer, but if you have a great product, you can educate your customers to like it rather than kowtowing to mass-market appeal."

The issue of quality is so central to Costco's purchasing decisions that buyers are rarely concerned with price point until they are satisfied a product will meet their members' expectations. With such a focus on quality, the first step a manufacturer should take before approaching Costco is to truly assess whether their product is distinguished from a quality perspective in comparison to competitive products.

2023 Survey – In the 2023 warehouse club industry survey, club suppliers were asked to rate Costco's focus on product quality. Respondents were asked to choose from one of our options: very important (product quality is number one for Costco), fairly important (product quality is among the two top considerations), important (product quality along with several other attributes are equally considered) and slightly important (product quality importance has fallen behind several other attributes).

66% of respondents said product quality was very important, 23% of respondents said product quality was fairly important, 8% of respondents said product quality was important and 3% of respondents said product quality was slightly important.

Continuous Improvement – A Costco employee commented on the importance of communication between suppliers and buyers and how the company's focus on quality is synonymous with continuous improvement.

He said, "At Costco, we continuously look at all levers we can pull to help offset rising costs. In the end, and in our non-food category with highly visible SKUs, we focus on continuous improvement ... adding quality, differentiating from other brands and improving the product specification versus reducing in any areas. Costco is willing to review and accept pathways to an improved offering, if the costs can be justified. There is no pulse for delivering a lower quality spec in the face of high inflationary times. Keep communication open and collaborate to offer an improved premium quality product."

Expect Pressure – Costco buyers are item merchants and they will spend the time to make sure each item they purchase meets their standards. A small broker commented on that pressure and Costco's need to understand everything about a supplier. He said, "Costco operates very much like an ingredient's customer on all items. They will want to understand your ingredients and process with a focus on safety and quality. You will need to be ready to share some uncomfortable information you probably don't share with any other customer."

Private Label – For Kirkland Signature private label products, product quality is Costco's first concern and is a more significant factor than price.

Although the following quote is from a June, 2006 article from the *Motley Fool Stock Advisor*, it does reinforce Costco's commitment to producing high quality private label items. Jim Sinegal, who retired in 2012, was Costco's founder and president and chief executive officer. He said, "Our albacore tuna ... is the highest quality that you can find. It is going to sell for roughly the same price as the brand-name tuna, but there is no comparison when you take a look at the product. Take two cans of tuna, the brand and the Kirkland Signature, and spread it out on the table and you are going to see what the difference is. We are prepared to bring better products to our customers because we think they want them and we think the Kirkland name is the way to do it."

Low Prices

Costco's goal is to sell merchandise at the lowest possible price. Costco will not sell any branded item for more than a 14% gross margin and any private label item for more than a 15% gross margin. To back this up, Costco has reports that notify executives when this situation occurs, so an explanation can be given. When offered rebates and allowances from vendors, Costco's philosophy is to reflect those deals in the cost of goods and lower the item's retail price.

2023 Survey – In the 2023 warehouse club industry survey, club suppliers were asked what merchandise gross margins the clubs generated on their products. Respondents do not necessarily know the cost each club allocates for its cross dock and/or distribution center. Therefore, the merchandise gross margin results may be slightly elevated.

Costco's merchandise gross margin continues to be the lowest in the club industry at between 13% and 14%. The merchandise gross margins at BJ's and Sam's Club, as reported by respondents, have increased. Sam's merchandise gross margins increased from 16% in 2015 to 17% in 2018 to 19% in 2021 and 2023. BJ's merchandise gross margins were the highest among the three clubs each survey year at 18% in 2015, 20% in 2018 and 22% in 2021 and 2023.

Six Merchandising Rights

Costco's buying and merchandising philosophy is based on Sol Price's six rights of merchandising. A Costco food vendor said, "Costco has specific things they are looking for. I follow Costco's blueprint which is the six rights of merchandising. Along with understanding Costco, their member and their merchandising strategy, I know exactly how to prepare for meetings." The six rights of merchandising provide the:

1. **Right Merchandise** – High quality brand name and private label items.
2. **Right Place** – Merchandising standards created to maximize sales, secure product and reduce handling and storage.
3. **Right Time** – Maintain in-stock positions without being overstocked and transition seasonal merchandise.
4. **Right Quantity** – Utilize just-in-time principles when ordering merchandise.
5. **Right Condition** – Merchandise should be packaged, pre-marked and prepared for the club environment.
6. **Right Price** – Assure low prices through volume buying, expense reduction and low gross margins.

Consumer Members

Costco's focus on the business owner started when it opened its first club in Seattle, Washington. The company knew that by attracting business owners, they were also attracting wealthy individuals who would also shop for themselves. In a November 10, 2003 article in *Fortune*, Jeff Brotman, co-founder and former chairman of the board of directors at Costco who passed away in 2017, said, "We understood that small-business owners, as a rule, are the wealthiest people in a community, so they would not only spend significant money on their businesses, they'd spend a lot on themselves if you gave them quality and value."

However, over time, Costco's buying and operating strategy changed. Today, Costco is more focused on sourcing items for its consumer members. In 1988, the composition of Costco's paid members was: 45% consumer and 55% business and supplemental business. By 2023, the composition of Costco's paid members was: 82% consumer and 18% business and supplemental business.

As the percentage of Costco's consumer members increased, the percentage of wholesale items stocked at its locations decreased. Of its overall product selection, wholesale merchandise accounted for: 32% (1,244 SKUs) in 2007, 28% (950 SKUs) in 2015 and 17% (545 SKUs) in 2023. Costco's wholesale selection at its traditional club locations is "far and away" the smallest in the industry.

2023 Survey – In the 2023 warehouse club industry survey, club suppliers were asked to provide an example of an item that was successfully downsized and made more appealing for consumer members at Costco?

The large majority of respondents said they have never experienced Costco downsizing one of their items nor would they expect Costco to willingly reduce the package size of an existing item. However, some respondents provided general acknowledgement that Costco downsized an item and a few provided specific examples.

For those suppliers and brokers who provided a general example of Costco downsizing an item, all mentioned that the cost per unit-of-measure from the large package to the smaller package was maintained. A medium food supplier said, "From my experience, the only successful downsizes are generally when there are freshness/count issues." A medium food vendor said, "This is a long time ago, but we were able to demonstrate that our DSD bakery item was too many calories and it lasted too long in the member's homes for them to think their family liked it, so ... we argued it had a negative member value due to size."

A large food supplier said that, recently, Costco has been more open to downsizing due to the pandemic. A large food supplier said, “[We] downsized due to manufacturing challenges in meeting net weight. [The] downsized item delivered the same price per ounce.” A large food supplier said they will be approaching Costco about downsizing their item. He said, “We are considering downsizing an item that may have gone over a significant price cliff for us. We will collaborate with Costco buyers on any changes. Joint decisions will be key.”

Reduced Operating Expenses

One of Costco’s goals is to constantly improve club operations as well as search for ways to reduce costs. By reducing operating costs, Costco’s philosophy is to use those savings to reduce retail prices and to help improve overall profitability.

Limited Assortment – Costco has consistently kept its SKU count around 3,200 to 3,400 items. This enables Costco to merchandise most of its items on full pallets, reducing the amount of labor needed to restock those SKUs during the day. This is especially important as items that need to be pulled down from the steel during business hours require three employees, one to drive the forklift and two on either side of the aisle to prevent members from entering. Reducing the number of times employees retrieve inventory from the steel clearly reduces expenses.

Advertising – Costco views advertising as a cost and it has never been part of its operating strategy. Sinegal said, “If you advertise, you have to raise the price of the merchandise ... We feel that the most successful type of advertising is word of mouth. When people are saying good things about you, it is much more important than when you say them about yourself.”

Salary and Benefits – Costco’s salary and benefit program is among the best in the retail industry. Costco believes that by paying well, employees stay with the company longer, learn the business and make its overall operation more efficient. Sinegal said, “It’s just good business. I mean obviously anyone who is a business person thinks about the importance of people to their operation. You’ve got to want to get the very best people that you can, and you want to be able to keep them and provide some job security for them. That’s not just altruism, it’s good business.”

Fresh Foods

Costco’s fresh food departments (meat, bakery, produce, deli and prepared foods) are an important part of its business model. Not only is sales growth robust with fresh food comparable sales consistently among Costco’s strongest but the departments help to increase member shopping frequency.

Fresh Food Introduction – Costco was the first club to introduce fresh foods. Ed Maron, a former Costco executive, was given responsibility for introducing fresh foods at Costco in the late 1980s. The company was committed to the fresh food concept which helped it overcome many mistakes. Maron said, “That was really the first idea that we didn’t clone from Price Club. The general sense was that fresh foods wouldn’t work in the club format. We made every mistake that could be made, but we learned from every one of them.”

Simplistic Philosophy – In an interview with *Meat & Deli Retailer* (the October/November 2007 issue), Doug Holbrook, assistant general merchandise manager for fresh meat and corporate foods at Costco (at the time), said, “A limited number of SKUs enable our buyers to make sure the items they are purchasing are done right ... We don’t make things complicated. We don’t cut a thin pork chop, or a thick pork chop, or a stuffed pork chop or a butterfly pork chop. We cut a boneless pork chop. What made us successful is making sure we are right with the top items.”

Creativity

One of Costco’s key buying strategies is to constantly “push the envelope” in terms of its product assortment. A non-food vendor said, “Costco’s buyers have full authority to do what they want. They’re given freedom to make mistakes.” Commenting on Costco’s coffin business, Sinegal said, “When somebody sees that you’re willing to take a chance on coffins, odds are they’ll come up with some other good ideas.”

Costco’s vice president and general merchandise manager of bakery, service deli and food service said, “The best method for us is to put [a new item] in a club and see if it has legs. We sometimes spend a lot of time creating items that last a few weeks. If something is not growing it needs to be changed. And we’ll also take an item that is really good and try to make it better ... Some items sell great for six months and then drop off as members tire of them, while others last two to five years. But new items are the spice that keeps people coming back. By offering different selections you get more of their attention.”

Supply Chain

Costco's supply chain is an important component of its business strategy. Three recent examples exemplify that focus: Go Green Agriculture, Innoval Solutions and Lincoln Premium Poultry.

Go Green Agriculture – Costco partnered with California-based Go Green Agriculture on an organic romaine lettuce program. Costco invested in the business to “address food safety concerns, increase water efficiency and reduce waste”. Go Green Agriculture built a 600,000 square foot greenhouse that operates 365 days a year and grows organic romaine lettuce for Costco. The greenhouse is located near Costco's distribution center in Tracy, California which reduces transportation costs and fuel usage. The greenhouse produces the equivalent of 150 planted field acres with 0% water runoff and 0% field erosion.

Innoval Solutions – Since 1939, Sears Logistics operated as a division within Sears, Roebuck and Company (Sears). Sears Logistics warehoused, transported, delivered and installed merchandise for Sears' (and eventually Kmart) customers. Sears Logistics grew to become a very profitable division.

Eddie Lampert purchased Sears in 2013. In 2014, recognizing the value at Sears Logistics, the division was rebranded as Innoval Solutions (Innoval). Without a clear affiliation with Sears, Innoval was able to offer its services to third party retail and eCommerce companies. Costco became a customer in 2015 and at least through 2018, Amazon was a customer.

In its first full year post-rebranding, Innoval made 20,000 deliveries. By 2017, that number increased to 350,000 with more than four million deliveries in 2019/2020. Innoval specializes in delivering large, bulky items such as major appliances, furniture, mattresses, televisions, grills, patio sets, fitness equipment and wine cellars. By 2020, Innoval employed 1,500 people, operated 11 warehouses and 100 smaller cross dock facilities, had more than 1,100 trucks, could deliver to approximately 93% of the United States and operated a dedicated call center.

In March, 2020, Costco acquired Innoval for \$1.0 billion. As part of the agreement, Costco committed to long-term commercial agreements where Innoval would continue to provide supply chain services for Sears and Kmart customers. In a March 18, 2020 interview with *Supply Chain Drive*, Richard Galanti, Costco's executive vice president and chief financial officer, said, “We think [Innoval] will not only allow us to put more on that platform, but also be able to grow those areas at a faster rate ... It's a business that can be more profitable if you have more volume running through it ... We think long term, strategically, it's very good for us and could save on costs.”

Lincoln Premium Poultry – In 2016, Costco created a company called Lincoln Premium Poultry (LPP). LPP manages and operates Costco's \$400 million chicken processing division based in Fremont, Nebraska. Walt Shafer, a former Pilgrim's Pride executive, is chief operating officer of LPP. LPP began exclusively supplying Costco's locations in 2019 with rotisserie and fresh chicken SKUs.

In an interview with *Meatingplace.com*, Shafer commented on Costco's strategy behind the entire project. He said, “Costco's strategy is really looking out over the next 20-plus years. [What they told me was,] ‘We need to know how to feed the world in the future and where our supply is going to come from.’”

Costco targeted the Nebraska area for its poultry complex due in part because of access to corn, farmers, labor and water. The complex includes a feed mill, a hatchery and a processing facility. LPP employs approximately 800 people. LPP partners with approximately 80 to 125 growers who receive baby chickens from the hatchery shortly after they are hatched and raise them until they are grown to LPP specifications. The chickens are shipped back to LPP for processing.

LPP processed approximately two million chickens per week. Of that total, 800,000 chickens will be used for Costco's rotisserie chicken program and 1.2 million chickens will be deboned and used for Costco's fresh and frozen chicken program.

Shafer commented on the unique way LPP will receive and handle chickens prior to processing. Shafer said, “All of our trucks, when they come in, they will pull inside our processing plant ... I have the capacity to hold 12 tractor trailer loads inside. We're able to cool these birds when it's warm outside. We're able to warm them up if it's cold outside ... We have a robotic system in there that will take those modules that the birds are in. All of those modules will be cleaned and sanitized after every time they are used. Those trucks and trailers will be cleaned and sanitized, all taking place inside the plant on every trip [for] disease control.”

The three slaughter line plant uses a more human way to process the chickens. Instead of slaughtering chickens by hanging them live from their feet on a wet conveyer line, stunning them electronically and then slitting their throats, the LPP plant will use carbon dioxide to render the chicken's unconscious before they are shackled upside prior to having their throats slit. The process creates safer working conditions for employees and creates a more accurate and pain-free killing process.

Private Label

In 1995, Costco introduced its Kirkland Signature private label brand. Its private label strategy initially focused on premium SKUs in high volume “consumer need” categories. Costco has three primary considerations for Kirkland Signature items: source high quality items at the lowest price, be respectful of the people and animals who produce those products and be respectful of the environment where those items are grown, produced, harvested, processed, packaged and distributed.

As members began to recognize Kirkland Signature’s quality, Costco expanded its selection to categories and items not traditionally associated with private label products. As of March, 2024, Costco’s 599 private label items generated 25.9% of the company’s overall sales.

Co-Branding - An important concept in developing a strong private label program is member acceptance. One way that Costco achieves this is to co-brand its Kirkland Signature label with existing brand-name products.

By associating the Kirkland Signature name with an existing known consumer brand, members associate the quality of the branded company to Costco and Kirkland Signature. Costco has placed its Kirkland Signature label on the following products: jelly beans with Jelly Belly, aluminum foil with Reynolds, grape juice with Newman’s Own, cranberry juice with Ocean Spray and whole bean coffee with Starbucks.

Organic

Costco’s first organic item, Earthbound Farm’s organic spring greens, was stocked in 1992 and its first Kirkland Signature organic item, milk, was stocked in 2004. Costco’s organic selection increased from 50 items in 2012 to 206 SKUs in 2023 including 68 Kirkland Signature private label organic items which represented 33% of its overall organic selection.

Today, Costco’s organic business generates approximately \$4 billion in sales annually. Costco’s focus on organic merchandise has grown over the past few years due to six benefits it accrues from these items:

1. Organic merchandise reinforces a member’s perception of Costco’s focus on product quality.
2. Organic merchandise is more expensive to produce resulting in higher retail price points helping to increase Costco’s average transaction.
3. Organic merchandise adds to the treasure hunt club buying philosophy.
4. Organic merchandise supports Costco’s search for exclusive or hard to find products.
5. Organic merchandise generates the necessary sales dollars for Costco buyers to continue to purchase otherwise these items would not be stocked.
6. Costco has found that in many cases, organic merchandise sales are incremental. For example, sales of organic ground beef did not dramatically reduce sales of non-organic ground beef.

Vendor Support – For farmers, converting an operation to produce organic products is not only expensive but time consuming. Additionally, weather and pests can interfere with a crop at any time. For that reason, Costco not only works very closely with its organic suppliers/farmers but supports them for the long term.

Jeff Lyons, senior vice president and general merchandise manager of fresh food, said, “If along the way, a problem occurs with an organic crop due to weather or pest influences, then sometimes that farmer, depending on how far along that crop is, loses everything. In that case, the farmer may have to go to conventional just to save his farm ... and we would support him and buy the conventional item from him.”

Product Development – When developing new organic items or asking a farmer to convert a conventional item to organic, Costco works closely with suppliers to determine if the club operator will be able to offer a value for the new/converted organic item. Lyons said, “We’re not ever going to have a supplier plant something and then hurt them. We’d rather know upfront what the costs are going to be. If they say it’s going to be five times the cost of conventional, we’d probably say ... ‘Let’s look at this and see if there’s something else we can do.’”

Supply – Lyons discussed the issues farms/suppliers face regarding supply on their organic items. He said, “With organic crops, [farmers] don’t have some of the tools that they would have with conventional crops, so they have to make sure they’ve got good weather and good everything for the crop to make it to delivery. With certain produce, such as leafy greens, it’s easier to grow organic because they repopulate quickly ... In some products, such as blueberries, it takes three years for an organic blueberry plant to propagate and give off any fruit.”

Selling Costco Buyers

In addition to the ten key buying and merchandising philosophies listed previously, there are several important concepts (in no particular order) that further define what Costco buyers want and need from a vendor to create a successful club item.

Meeting Preparation – Costco buyers expect a vendor to be an expert on their product, competitive items and marketplace trends. A food vendor said, “Be prepared to know your product inside and out. Costco buyers are the most knowledgeable buyers on products, production and ingredients.”

The depth of questioning from a Costco buyer is usually far more detailed than what is experienced in most other retail settings. Vendors should be prepared to discuss the following seven subjects: product components, production, market presence, quality, packaging, marketing and purchasing/ordering requirements.

Package Sizes – Costco buyers are more likely to purchase larger sized products in comparison to BJ's and Sam's Club buyers. In a July, 2012 interview with *The Motley Fool*, Sinegal said, “The larger sizes almost always create a better savings for the consumer. It's very rare when it doesn't create a significant savings, and so we view it from that standpoint.”

In addition to potentially attaining a lower unit cost, larger packages positively affect the clubs in the following four ways: the club's average transaction increases helping to reduce payroll as a percentage of sales, studies have shown that larger packages are consumed more quickly potentially increasing sales, the club generates higher gross margin dollars and, in most cases, more product can be engineered to fit on a pallet or a truck lowering the freight cost per selling unit.

Sustainable Buying – Costco buyers want to purchase merchandise from suppliers who use sustainable production methods or from organizations whose goal is to support the people who produce the products. The following are four examples:

Rwandan Coffee – For approximately three months a year, Costco sells a Kirkland Signature private label whole bean coffee grown and processed in Rwanda. Sinegal became involved in Rwanda through a meeting with two Costco investors. That conversation dovetailed into a discussion on Rwanda with the investors suggesting Sinegal meet Paul Kagame, the president of Rwanda. Sinegal and President Kagame met for lunch in New York and discussed many things including Rwanda's coffee business. Sinegal learned about Rwanda's strong coffee growing climate and the high quality coffee grown in the country.

Costco buyers were sent to Rwanda to investigate and “without any prompting from” Sinegal, created a purchasing system for premium Rwandan coffee making sure the resulting funds were paid to Rwandan farmers. Sinegal said, “They also initiated a program to enhance the farmers' production of the beans by setting up washing stations and pulling out the best beans. Today, I think we buy something like 25% of the premium coffee coming out of Rwanda.”

Flowers – Costco only sells Rainforest Alliance roses which are certified as sustainably grown. A Costco floral buyer, said, “Costco was one of the first retailers in the country to commit to only selling sustainably grown long-stemmed cut roses. This assures the company and Costco members that the beautiful flowers they purchase in the warehouse are not causing harm to the people who grow them.”

Costco's rose distribution system keeps the flowers at a temperature of 35 degrees Fahrenheit. Rose specifications include a minimum length of 19.67-inches (50 centimeters) and most varieties have slightly opened buds. In terms of distribution, Costco's goal is for the flowers to travel two to five days from harvest to the production facility and less than two more days of travel to a club location.

Animal Welfare – Costco is continuing to update its animal welfare commitment. It currently has audit programs that analyze animal welfare on the farm and at slaughter. These audits can be performed by Costco auditors, suppliers or third parties. The frequency, type and intensity varies across suppliers and species.

Seafood – Costco's life below water commitment states, “We will continually source sustainable seafood products from either wild fisheries or farmed aquaculture in ways that help meet current demands without compromising the availability of scarce resources for future generations.”

Costco works with its suppliers towards that goal. For example, all of Costco's Kirkland Signature solid white albacore tuna in water suppliers are participants in the International Seafood Sustainability Foundation (ISSF) and are audited by a third party against ISSF conservation measures.

Another example can be found with tilapia. To ensure uniform thickness for its Kirkland Signature frozen tilapia, Costco uses only the top loin. Instead of discarding the bottom loin, Costco partnered with two suppliers that use the bottom loin for two value added frozen SKUs at the club operator: High Liner tortilla crusted tilapia and Trident Seafoods panko breaded tilapia.

IRI/Nielsen Data – Since 2004, Cosco and Information Resources Incorporated (IRI) have been providing vendors in the United States and Canada with access to sales and inventory information through the Costco Collaborative Retail Exchange (CRX) point-of-sale program. The data platform is managed by IRI.

Some of the program features included: vendors can benchmark their product sales data against the category as well as sub-categories, vendors can receive daily sales and inventory of their items every day of the week from all locations, five supply chain data points are included (inventory, average days supply, in transit orders, on order and orders received) and the category data includes three years of historical seasonal trends.

National Buying Group – Costco's national buying committees are comprised of buyers and/or general merchandise managers from each region. The buying committees work with select items from food and sundry categories and make company-wide purchases. The national buying group's goal is to reduce product costs seeking a decline of 15% to 20%.

MVM Coupon Program – Costco's MVM (multi vendor mailer) coupon program is run approximately 11 to 12 times per year for approximately 25 days each. Each MVM has approximately 90 to 110 items. MVM redemption rates are extremely high. Costco and its vendors plan for those high redemption rates and order an appropriate amount of product prior to an item's MVM period. As a result, MVM coupon items typically receive a free end cap.

Food Safety – Craig Wilson, vice president of quality assurance and food safety at Costco, discussed the company's food safety program with *Food Safety Magazine* in 2019. The topics included: Costco's four key food safety pillars, its regulatory strategy, its test and hold program and its recall plan.

Four Food Safety Pillars – Costco's four food safety pillars include the following: training, audit, quality assurance and top down support. Costco's food safety training program is provided entirely by an in-house staff. The company believes so strongly in the long-term benefits of food safety that every employee, before they are hired, must attend a food safety course. The purpose of that course is not just to inform but to emphasize how important food safety is to Costco.

Wilson reports directly to all key executives and the company's board of directors fully support Wilson's department. Costco has focused on food safety for so long that it has become a part of the company culture. The company and its employees understand that the purpose of food safety is to protect the member which protects the company brand and reputation.

Regulatory Strategy – In general, Costco tries to be proactive when it comes to local, state and federal food code regulations. Instead of having different policies and procedures based on different local, state, federal and international standards, Costco attempts to have one policy that exceeds all those stakeholders. The company has been so successful in creating its food safety program, nine states use Costco locations as training grounds for new food safety inspectors.

Test and Hold – Costco's test and hold program is extensive. It began a more limited test and hold program over 20 years ago when it had an e Coli issue at its meat processing plant. In 2006, Costco began a test and hold program for all ready-to-eat items and/or fresh bagged items (salads for example). Products within Costco's food court and in its bakery, deli, dairy and produce departments go through test and hold. Today, Costco's test and hold program takes as little as six hours.

Recall Plan – Due to its membership program, every purchase is tracked and that data and information is confidential. The only time Costco uses it is when there is a recall issue with a product. Every member who purchased a recall item at Costco will not only receive a phone call but will also receive a follow-up letter, text or Email. Costco can call 3.8 million members an hour. Costco can notify members the day they are notified of a recall. Not only are member's appreciative of this policy but regulators like it as well.

When an item is recalled, Costco's most important priority is member protection. Wilson said, "Our primary focus is to protect the member all the time, first and foremost. I don't care about cost. I don't care about anything else." Wilson immediately blocks an item from being sold and has that item immediately pulled from the sales floor at every club worldwide.

Voucher SKUs – Costco's voucher program continues to include a wide assortment of discounted gift cards, premium merchandise and out-of-box services and products. One company, FEVO, is Costco's ticketing vendor of record. FEVO partners with teams/events to sell tickets to Costco members in club locations and on Costco.com.

FEVO's program primarily features two options: partners can offer a 20% minimum discounted ticket package or a ticket package without discounts but includes value added offerings such as food, beverage, merchandise, parking discounts or vouchers that amount to at least 20% of the purchase price. Additionally, FEVO handles printing, shipping and other "back office" functions that were normally managed by the team/event.

Item Deletion – When Costco initially buys an item, it is usually purchased as a rotational SKU. If a new item sells more slowly than a buyer anticipated, the vendor may be asked for assistance through demonstrations and markdown money to improve sales. There are times when a buyer will even delete an item even though it is selling well. This can happen due to: seasonality, SKU count focus, the product no longer offers a value or too many "like" items in a category.

There are four primary ways a manufacturer can prepare for an item being deleted: understand the buyer's intention before the product is purchased, understand Costco will not guarantee an item longer than 30 days so inventory must be managed, packaging raw materials must be conservatively managed and stay in relatively constant communication with the buyer especially within the first few weeks of the product's life cycle.

Business Center – In 1991, Costco recognized that, long term, its traditional club locations might not be the best vehicle to serve wholesale members. However, Costco could not ignore wholesale members due to their potential spending power. Costco's business center division was created in 1991 to exclusively service its wholesale members. In the last seven years, Costco has aggressively expanded the number of business center locations. At the end of 2014, Costco operated 10 business centers and has increased that total to 33 locations at the end of 2023.

Costco's business centers provide delivery and walk-in business through its locations that are approximately 115,000 square feet. Business centers do not generally stock consumer categories such as apparel, jewelry, sporting goods, books, music, seasonal or toys. Most of the merchandise does not change. A typical Business Center will have a delivery radius of approximately 50 miles. With its hybrid format of walk-in and delivery, the Costco Business Center provides the company with several competitive advantages.

The two most important competitive advantages include: the Costco Business Center better meets the needs of wholesale members and enables traditional Costco locations within that delivery radius to increase its number of consumer items. For example, Costco operates 23 locations in Illinois of which nine are in the Chicago market. One of those Chicago locations is a Costco Business Center in Bedford Park (a former traditional club that was converted in 2015).

A 50-mile radius from this location includes 20 of the remaining 22 other traditional Costco locations (East Peoria and Champaign are the only clubs outside that 50-mile radius). So, theoretically, a Costco business member who shops at any one of those 20 traditional locations could use the Costco Business Center as its primary product source by shopping at the building or having merchandise delivered.

A Costco Business Center provides four other distinct competitive advantages. Where a Business Center exists: BJ's and Sam's Club can't meet the needs of its business members in the same way, Costco can potentially acquire business members that used to shop at BJ's and Sam's Club, Costco buyers can be more creative when it comes to developing consumer items for its traditional locations due to its reduced wholesale selection in those buildings and the full line selection of a Business Center enables Costco to market the operation to customers who might not have considered the retailer previously.

Regional Suppliers - The December, 2012 issue of *The Costco Connection* included an article about regional food suppliers. Buyers in Costco's regional offices are always looking for unique regional products. Tim Rose, senior vice president of foods and sundries (at the time of the article), said, "When we search out some of these regional suppliers, we know they're not going to be able to supply the whole United States right out of the chute."

Rose mentioned one regional supplier that grew to supply the company worldwide. Rose said, "Johnny's was a small restaurant in Tacoma [Washington] that used to sell seasoning salt next to their register and now it's not only sold nationally, but globally." One rule that Costco uses when working with smaller regional suppliers is to never become too large a part of their business. Rose said, "We have a rule that we don't want to be more than 25 percent of someone's business."

Online – Costco's online sales were \$14.26 billion in fiscal 2023. Costco's online sales represent approximately 57 locations and offer a significant opportunity for vendors to expand their business with the club operator. Costco offers online sales in the United States, Canada, the United Kingdom, Mexico, Taiwan, Korea, Japan and Australia.

Leveraging Costco – StriVectin, an anti-aging skin care brand, began selling Costco in 2007. The company learned it could leverage select items in exclusive sizes at Costco and "drive" customers to where its products are sold at full margin. Joan Malloy, chief executive officer of StriVectin, said, "At that point [2007], the club channel was not seen as a destination for a \$139 moisturizer, and some in the industry questioned why a prestige skin-care brand ... would enter the [club] channel."

Jennifer Trevethan, senior vice president of sales and education at StriVectin, said, "The relationship has been a true win-win. By offering just a few products in exclusive sizes, and only for short periods of time, we're able to drive trials among Costco members who then have the opportunity to shop the broader StriVectin product line at specialty retailers."

Item Formulation – In the 2020 warehouse club industry survey, club suppliers were asked what are some of the ingredients to avoid when formulating items for Costco and what input do Costco buyers provide? A few respondents commented that Costco buyers will offer their opinions about product formulation.

A medium food supplier said, "Artificial anything. Involving Costco buyers in formulation can be tricky. The younger buyers are very opinionated and offer advice freely. The seasoned buyers are more humble and cautious." A small food supplier said, "Artificial flavors and dyes [should be avoided]. Costco will review your ingredient statements."

Several respondents commented specifically on key ingredients to avoid. A small food broker said, “[Avoid] caramel coloring, nitrates, sodium sulfate, preservatives and coloring.” Other respondents said to avoid products with the following: high sugar content, liquid smoke, antibiotics, preservatives and carrageenan. A couple respondents said that sodium tripolyphosphate should never be used especially in shrimp and chicken. A large food vendor said, “[Avoid] anything that is not natural. [You] always want a very clean label.”

A couple respondents commented that Costco tries to avoid products produced in certain countries. A medium food vendor said, “Ingredients that are chemically treated or sourced from certain countries are not allowed. For seafood items, the raw material must be sustainably sourced with 3rd party certification (MSC, etc.)” A large broker was more specific. He said, “They try to avoid food processed in China as much as possible with the notable exceptions of mandarin oranges, edamame and pine nuts.”

However, suppliers should know that the desire to avoid certain ingredients will vary by region. A large food vendor said, “This varies widely by region. There are no ingredients we avoid but some regions are more focused on organic and better for you, than others.”

Asian Consumers – According to a December 31, 2023 report from Numerator, a larger percentage of Asian Americans are Costco members compared to the percentage of Asian Americans nationally. According to the report, Asian Americans represent approximately 7% of the population nationally but represent approximately 10% of Costco members.

There are five reasons that could explain why Costco has a larger percentage of Asian American members. First, Costco continues to grow in Asia with 71 locations (33 in Japan, 18 in Korea, 14 in Taiwan and six in China) and its knowledge of Asian products has progressively increased as it serves members in those markets. Second, Asian American consumers are the fastest growing demographic in the United States and their spending power is accelerating as a result.

Third, Asian Americans tend to have larger households than the average United States consumer. Fourth, Asian Americans tend to prefer purchasing in bulk. Lastly, word-of-mouth referrals are also playing a part as Asian American members at Costco are more likely to talk about their experiences shopping at the club operator.

Commenting on any company’s potential in serving Asian Americans, Kymberly Graham, vice president and head of commercial DEI at NielsenIQ, said, “For Asian Americans, their rate of population acceleration certainly leads to this idea that ... they’re going to be creating major market shifts. If their needs are being served, it inherently becomes very profitable for anyone that’s serving them.”

Commenting on the word-of-mouth referral concept, Marshal Cohen, chief industry analyst for NPD Group, said, “Every once in a very blue moon would you hear about a major retailer focused in on the Asian community. Word of mouth and the influence of the community spreads, and that’s what helps elevate a business. So, if a business like a Costco caters to the Asian community, they share that out and that multiplies out.”

Exclusivity – One of Costco’s buying strategy is to provide members with products that can’t be purchased at other retailer or club operators. Part of that strategy is to create exclusive formulas for certain products.

Alcohol – Chad Sokol, assistant vice president and general merchandise manager of wine and liquor at Costco, has worked for the company since 1993. He took over the alcohol department in 2019 when Annette Alvarez-Peters retired. Costco’s annualized alcohol sales are estimated at \$16.21 billion with wine representing approximately 50%, spirits representing approximately 30% and beer and ready-to-drink (RTD) representing approximately 20%.

Costco’s wine and liquor strategy includes regional suppliers. Sokol said, “I encourage our buyers to stay ahead of trends. We have great regional buyers and we utilize their talents, along with our e-commerce team, to make sure we’re stocking items that work in each unique market. Costco has a good reputation in the industry and I hope to keep expanding our network of suppliers. I’m hopeful we will continue to find partners who can find creative ways to work with us as we continue to expand.”

Commenting on the company’s focus on stocking a limited number of SKUs, Sokol said, “Only having a few options for any given category, especially fine wine, encourages our members to try new items and is less overwhelming for consumers. With the increased sales volume over the last year, we’ve had many rotations sell through much quicker than expected, which helps us achieve our goal of always having something new every time our members shop with us.”

Notes